Population Movements: geography, identity, markets and integration

First Annual Report, 1 April 2003 - 31 March 2004

As the Programme started relatively slowly and with some delays this first report is extended to cover the first 18 months of activity. The accompanying budget, however, is confined to 12 months, as required by the Trust for accounting purposes.

1. Research Projects

1.1 The Geography of Human Smuggling and Trafficking (UCL) (May, 2003 – September, 2004)

Staff

Dr Khalid Koser was Project Leader. Besides taking administrative responsibility for the project, he was responsible for research undertaken in Afghanistan and Pakistan. Ali Ahmad was appointed from 1 October 2003 as a full-time Research Assistant. He has been responsible for fieldwork in the UK. Professor John Salt has assisted in the overall direction of the project, as well with key stakeholder interviews in the UK. James Clarke has worked on data search and analysis relating to irregular migration. Melanie Petros has worked on the project as an unpaid intern. Her main responsibility has been to conduct a literature review, focusing in particular on smuggling and trafficking costs and routes.

Research Undertaken

A literature review, data collection and fieldwork preparations started in May, 2003.

Between October and December two four-week field visits took place in Afghanistan and Pakistan. During the first, interviews were conducted in Kabul, Islamabad and Peshawar with: key informants from Government, NGOs, press and academia; eight smugglers and eight deportees who had previously been smuggled from the region towards Western Europe. During the second visit, a quantitative survey was conducted among 50 households in Karachi from which family members had recently been smuggled to Western Europe. Field reports on both visits were produced and circulated internally, and they include a full list of respondents.

Between January and July 2004, interviews with smuggled and other illegal migrants have focused on four London boroughs – Newham, Waltham Forest, Ealing and Brent. In total, 19 Pakistanis and 4 Afghans were covered by this research component.

1 Full details of the aims and objectives of each project are in the full Programme Proposal and are not stated here unless they have had to be reconsidered.
It has been ethnographic in method, involving multiple in-depth interviews which have yielded rich qualitative data. In addition, interviews have taken place with four employers of smuggled and illegal migrants. A series of field reports have been produced and circulated internally.

The interviews with key stakeholders is still ongoing. To date interviews have taken place with representatives from the Heathrow Intelligence Unit and the Strategic Intelligence Team. Several more interviews are planned before the end of September 2004.

Convergences and Divergences with the Original Research Plan
The research as originally conceived had three main aims: (1) to investigate how human smuggling and trafficking are changing the geography of international migration, (2) to examine how human smuggling and trafficking are developing as a business and (3) to understand the implications of human smuggling and trafficking for migrants themselves.

These aims and objectives have guided fieldwork in Afghanistan, Pakistan and the UK and have been used to structure planned outputs from the project. Some modifications, however, proved necessary:
(1) It was decided early on in the project to focus on human smuggling rather than human trafficking. These are two quite separate phenomena which are largely incomparable, with smuggling being the less-researched.
(2) Inevitably there has been a particular focus on the changing geography of the particular migration sub-system under investigation – it is not too bold to suggest that as a result of this research this is now one of the best understood sub-systems in the world. At the same time, a global perspective has been yielded by analysis of secondary data by Petros.
(3) The focus on migration as a business emerged from an article by Salt and Stein (1997), the strength of which was to understand migration as an integrated network of actors and institutions operating transnationally. The current research has contributed to the development of this model, but once again it has not been possible to be comprehensive. There has been, for example, a particular focus on how money flows through the smuggling network, and a particular focus on actors and institutions in sending countries.
(4) As explained in the following section, it has proved very difficult to identify and interview smuggled migrants in the UK, so that the sample covered by this research is by no means necessarily representative – for example no women have been interviewed. However, there is a growing body of empirical information derived from surveys of migrants in an irregular situation. Our own survey information takes us beyond this.

Methods
One of the aims of this project was to ‘road-test’ appropriate methods for researching human smuggling and trafficking. The research has combined quantitative and qualitative methods with a wide range of involved actors. Certain methods have proved more successful than others, and certain actors more accessible than others, but overall the integration of methods has revealed a range of hitherto poorly understood aspects of human smuggling. Perhaps the greatest disappointment has
been the inability properly to conduct a ‘two-ended’ study, whereby families in Afghanistan and Pakistan are matched up with migrants in the UK.

**Outputs**

- **Seminars**
  
  *Ahmad* has given a paper based on the UK research at a half-day Programme workshop at UCL, focusing on research methods.
  
  *Koser* has given papers on his research in Afghanistan and Pakistan at a Geography Department seminar at UCL and a seminar at the Sussex Centre for Migration Research at the University of Sussex.
  
  In addition, a seminar to close the project and present its key findings is planned for December 2004/January 2005.

- **Conferences**
  
  *Koser* presented his research as a keynote lecture at the University of Western Australia in Perth

- **Publications in Progress**
  
  *Ahmad* has produced a series of working papers, focusing on the Pakistan-UK migration sub-system, ethics and methods of researching illegal populations and the illegal labour market. Several publications are planned from these papers, and these are currently being worked on.
  
  *Koser* has produced two field reports which have formed the basis for several papers. An article on ‘Why Smuggling Pays’ has been submitted to the *Transactions of the Institute of British Geographers*. Another, focusing in the ‘circuit of capital’ is being prepared for submission to *Economic Geography*.
  
  *Petros* has developed her work into an article entitled ‘The Costs of Human Smuggling and Trafficking’. Koser and Salt are co-authors and the paper will be submitted to *International Migration*.
  
  Several joint articles are also planned, in particular an article entitled ‘What is Smuggling?’ for submission to *Ethnic and Racial Studies*.

**1.2 Social Capital, Gender and Differential Outcomes (Bristol and UCL)**

(October, 2003 – September, 2005)

**Staff**

*Dr. Claire Dwyer* (UCL), *Professor Tariq Modood* (Bristol) and *Dr. Suruchi Thapar-Bjorkert* (Bristol) are the project leaders and responsible for the administration of the project.

*Dr. Gurchathen Sanghera* (Bristol), whose PhD was on child labour in India at Bradford University, was appointed from October 2003 as a full-time researcher. He has been responsible for conducting in-depth literature reviews and has also been responsible for fieldwork in Bradford, West Yorkshire.

*Dr. Bindi Shah* (UCL), whose Phd on Asian American girls is from University of California, Davis, was appointed as a full-time researcher in May 2004. She has contributed to a literature review on Asian masculinities and the design of research tools and is responsible for the fieldwork in Slough.
Research Undertaken
Thus far, two principal stages of the project have been completed and the third is currently underway.

Firstly, a literature review had been undertaken with a view to critically engaging with some of the principal concepts and theoretical approaches, including the work of:

- Social Capital and Gender – M. Molyneux, C. Campbell, V. Lowndes, E. Pantoja;
- Masculinity – M. Mac an Ghaill, R. W. Connell, C. Alexander;
- Pakistani Muslims in Britain – P. Werbner, T. Abbas, L. Archer, M. Anwar, V. Kalra, K. Haw.

This critical engagement has entailed a consideration of the gaps in the existing literature with respect to the aims and objectives of the project, the potential utility of the existing literature and how it relates to the project’s research questions.

Drawing on this review, fieldwork in Bradford and Slough has been prepared, organised and started (February-June 2004). This involved conducting background research to these sites, identifying the geographical areas of research within these sites and potential respondents, the completion of a topic guide for interviews with young men and women and parents, and a questionnaire. Furthermore, this also had entailed preliminary visits to these sites in order to identity and establish contacts with actors and agencies in the field that shall be important gatekeepers in gaining access to potential respondents – e.g. local agencies, community groups and workers, voluntary organisations, and schools. Pilot interviews were conducted in each site.

A pluralist approach to the research has been taken which involved the triangulation of research methods to include in-depth individual interviews, group interviews, questionnaires and participant observation.

This third stage, the extensive period of fieldwork, is currently in process. We are aiming for 80 interviews with young people, 20 with parents, and 3 focus groups (two single sex and one mixed). The aim is to complete the fieldwork by the end of January 2005, but it is hoped that data analysis can be commenced during the inevitable gaps in the fieldwork and that data can be incorporated into the presentations in Spring 2005 listed below.

Outputs
July 3, 2003 – Dwyer was a discussant in a session on ‘Contested Geographies of Race and Religion’ at the Annual Conference of the Royal Geographical Society and Institute of British Geographers.

May 18, 2004 – Modood, Sanghera and Thapar-Bjorkert presented the project and research to the ‘Programme for a Peaceful City’ at the University of Bradford.

We are submitting two abstracts for the British Sociological Association Conference, March 21 – 23, 2005.

We are to give, ‘Ethnicity as social capital? Explaining the differential educational achievements of young British Pakistani men and women’ at the international conference, ‘Whither Social Capital’, Southbank University, April 6-7, 2005.

Conferences Attended


Publications
Modood developed some of the thinking behind the project in relation to ethnicity, class and social capital in ‘Capitals, Ethnic Identity and Educational Qualifications’, Cultural Trends, Special Issue on Cultural Capital and Social Exclusion, guest edited by Tony Bennett and Mike Savage, 13(2), no 50, June 2004.

Sanghera has produced a series of literature reviews on social capital theory and gender in the context of Bradford. Several publications are planned from these papers.

Sanghera and Thapar-Bjorkert are currently working on a paper provisionally entitled, ‘Masculinities and Political Activism in Bradford – An Inevitable Contestation?’

Dwyer and Shah have produced a review of Asian young men and masculinities, which is being developed into a paper for publication.

We are contributing a chapter to a Harvard volume on ‘The Next Generation’.

1.3 Nation and Class in England (Bristol)
(February 2004 – January 2006)

Staff
Professor Steve Fenton is the project leader and is responsible for the administration of the project.
Dr Robin Mann from University of Wales, Bangor, where his PhD was on divisions in Wales surrounding bilingualism and the position of the Welsh language, was appointed as Research Assistant in February 2004.

Research Activity
Developing a literature review and bibliography has focussed on Englishness and Britishness, White ethnicity, working class racism and other qualitative research into nation and class. Particular attention has been given to the discursive construction of national identity, especially the writings of M. Billig, R. Wodak, N. Fairclough.
In outlining a research strategy, two contrasting social settings were identified – one small town/rural and one urban – with more or less advantaged respondents in each setting. A town in Gloucestershire of approximately 6000 people, situated about 20 miles north east of Bristol, has been identified as the small town/rural setting and fieldwork began there in July. In deciding upon this location, we utilised small area statistics from the 2001 census. This allowed us to find an appropriate site with a relatively mixed population of more and less advantaged individuals, and with a fair proportion of in-movers. Two Bristol wards, yet to be finalised, will then be the location for the second urban setting.

In each of the two settings, we will complete 50 individual interviews. For each interview a topic guide will be used. The topic guide provides for a more conversational method of inquiry and is designed to stimulate responses about themes of class, experience, place and the country. Around 35 of the interviews will be gained by randomly selecting respondents from an address list of the town. Using small area statistics from the 2001 census Letters were sent out to selected households informing residents of the project and our interest in talking to them. To date 25 of 35 have been completed.

We will also conduct 5 focus group discussions with certain societies or associations within the town, followed by 15 solo interviews with members of the focus groups. (35+15 = 50 per site). The group discussions are particularly important to the project in that group interaction, as opposed to one-to-one interaction, may be more conducive to discussing themes of national identity and class.

Two focus group discussions have been completed: one with Wotton Civic Society and one with Wotton Historical Society. The results from these initial interviews have been highly promising and demonstrate the potential for a number of significant findings. We have made contact with Stroud District Council; members of the council have helped us in meeting more potential interviewees.

Fieldwork at the first site will be completed by end of October 2004. Fieldwork at the Bristol site will then take place between November 2004 and April 2005, leaving a 9-month period for analysis and writing up.

1.4. Ethnic Segregation and Entry into the Labour Market (Bristol) (October, 2004 – September, 2006)

The segregation project was originally designed to focus on civic attitudes, linking the 2001 Home Office Citizenship Survey with the Census data to see if densities of segregation were linked to attitudes to social mixing, ethnic prejudice, fear of racism, feeling British and so on. The HOCS data tape was made available to researchers in December, 2003, when we discovered that no useful geographical variables have been included in the data. Hence, it is entirely unsuitable for segregation or any other spatial analysis. After spending some time investigating whether there was an alternative way of proceeding with the original focus, we decided to change the focus to entry into the labour market.
**Staff**
*Professor Ron Johnston, Dr Nabil Khattab and Professor Tariq Modood* are joint project directors. We are currently recruiting a quantitativist RA and in the Spring will also recruit a qualitative researcher.

**Project Details**
The literature on segregation and economic performance of ethnic minorities, especially in the US, differentiates between two major types of residential segregation: ethnic enclaves and ghettos. It suggests that ethnic enclaves protect minority workers from the harsh conditions of the secondary labour market, and from racial discrimination in the primary labour market, and sometimes providing them with better employment contracts than they would otherwise obtain. It also promotes their ability (at both the individual and the group levels) to generate socio-economic mobility by relying on the inter-ethnic resources available within the enclave.

In this research we are interested in looking at the relationship between residential segregation of ethnic minorities in Britain and their educational attainment and the process of transition from school/college to work. While focussing on early years of employment, we will seek to address the following larger questions:

1) To what extent ethnic concentration (residential segregation) is a form of deprivation (ghettos) or a form of ethnic enclave that promote the economic and social resources of minorities?

2) To what extent does residential segregation restrict educational attainment? In addressing this question we aim to examine the likelihood of a person who lives in a highly segregated area to obtain a certain qualification, a degree, for example, vis-à-vis someone who lives in less segregated area.

3) To what extent the relationship between educational attainment and labour market outcomes is influenced by segregation? In other words, will minority people who live in segregated areas receive lower returns to their educational attainment than those residing in less segregated areas?

We will carry out two types of studies: quantitative and qualitative. In the former we will analyse data from the 2001 UK census and other datasets, and in the latter we will collect and analyse qualitative data that we believe will illuminate the quantitative analyses by elaborating the experiences, perceptions, practices and behaviours on the part of jobseekers and employers that lead to the outcomes captured in the quantitative analyses. The exact details of the qualitative study, including the research sites, will be determined in the light of the results of the initial quantitative analyses.


*Professor John Salt* directs this project for which an RA is currently being recruited, and *Professor Peter Wood* will be part of the research team.
2. Programme Events

Programme Meetings
Thursday 6th November 2003 (Bristol)
Wednesday 18th February 2004 (UCL)

Advisory Board Meetings
Wednesday 18th February 2004 (UCL)

Workshops
Qualitative Methodologies, led by Prof Richard Black, University of Sussex and Dr Louise Archer, London Metropolitan University, 18th March, 2004

‘Muslims in Britain: The Making of a New Underclass?’, jointly with the Centre for the Study of Democracy, University of Westminster, 18 November, 2004. Full Programme is attached in the appendix.

“Human smuggling and migrant trafficking” Seminar to present main results of the project, with invited guests and Advisory Board members, January 2005.

Seminars


Conferences
“The Construction of Minority Identities in Britain and France”, Friday 17th & Saturday 18th September 2004, (Bristol; jointly with the Department of French). Full programme is attached in the appendix.

3. Teaching Replacement
At Bristol, the directorial and project staff teaching replacements were rolled together to create a three year full time lectureship starting in September, 2003. The appointee was Dr Nabil Khattab, a research fellow at Manchester University, who subsequently has been fully integrated into the Programme and is participating in project 4 above.

At UCL, Professor Paul Compton was appointed as a temporary lecturer to teach half of Salt’s course in Population Geography. Departmental Teaching Assistants taught Salt’s tutorials and assisted with seminars.
4. Administration and Communications
The Programme office is based at Bristol, where Modood is assisted by a part-time Administrator and a part-time Secretary. Dr Jo Haynes from Bristol University was the administrator from April – September, 2003, and Katherine Kerbes, a UWE graduate in sociology and gender studies, was appointed from November for the duration of the rest of the programme. A part-time secretary, Willow Reavley was appointed from March, 2004.

There exists an extensive international and national database of contacts and a Programme website was created in July, 2004 with the aim of promoting the effective communication and dissemination of Programme information and news. Kerbes takes responsibility for the site’s maintenance, ensuring that information is current and up-to-date.

The Leverhulme programme administration has taken the initiative in compiling a list and timetable of all the projects currently being carried out and proposed in the major funded programmes on international migration at the Universities of Oxford, Sussex and Bradford.

5. Advisory Group
An Advisory Group was set up and the first meeting took place on February 18th 2004 at UCL. The following people have been appointed:

- **Professor Richard Black**
  Director of Development Research Centre on Migration Globalisation & Poverty,
  Professor of Human Geography, University of Sussex

- **Dr Avtar Brah**
  Race & Ethnic Relations, Faculty of Continuing Education, Birkbeck College, University of London

- **Nick Clark**
  International Policy Organiser, Trades Union Congress

- **Professor Ram Gidoomal, CBE**
  Chair of London Sustainability Exchange,
  Trustee of Employability Forum

- **Professor Elspeth Guild**
  Visiting Professor, London School of Economics,
  Professor of European Migration Law, Centre for Migration Law - University of Nijmegen, Holland

- **Tom Hadley**
  Confederation of British Industry (CBI)

- **Professor Lord Bhikhu Parekh**
  Centennial Professor in the Centre for the Study of Global Governance, London School of Economics and Political Science (LSE)

- **David Pearce**
  Office for National Statistics

- **Trevor Phillips**
  Chair of Commission for Racial Equality
  Broadcaster and Journalist

- **Professor Pnina Webner**
  Professor of Social Anthropology, Keele University
6. New Developments

Tariq Modood, together with Dr Satnam Virdee of Glasgow University, acquired a grant of £140,000 from the ESRC for the project, ‘Racism, Ethnicity and Nationalism in Scotland and England’. The two year project starts in October, 2004 and will complement the two British national identity projects in the Programme.

Professor Tariq Modood
Professor John Salt
30 September, 2004