
Peer reviewed version

Link to published version (if available):
10.1542/peds.2016-2509

Link to publication record in Explore Bristol Research
PDF-document

This is the author accepted manuscript (AAM). The final published version (version of record) is available online via AAP at http://pediatrics.aappublications.org/content/early/2017/01/26/peds.2016-2509..info. Please refer to any applicable terms of use of the publisher.

University of Bristol - Explore Bristol Research

General rights

This document is made available in accordance with publisher policies. Please cite only the published version using the reference above. Full terms of use are available:
http://www.bristol.ac.uk/pure/about/ebr-terms
Smoking in Pregnancy and Child ADHD

Kristin Gustavson\textsuperscript{ab}, PhD; Eivind Ystrom\textsuperscript{ab}, PhD; Camilla Stoltenberg\textsuperscript{ac}, MD, PhD; Ezra Susser, MD, DrPH\textsuperscript{de}; Pål Surén\textsuperscript{a}, MD, PhD; Per Magnus\textsuperscript{a}, MD, PhD; Gun Peggy Knudsen\textsuperscript{a}, PhD; George Davey Smith\textsuperscript{f}, MD, DSc; Kate Langley\textsuperscript{gh}, PhD; Michael Rutter\textsuperscript{i}, MD; Heidi Aase\textsuperscript{a}, PhD; Ted Reichborn-Kjennerud\textsuperscript{aj}, MD, PhD

**Affiliations:**
\textsuperscript{a}Norwegian Institute of Public Health (Gustavson, Ystrom, Stoltenberg, Surén, Magnus, Knudsen, Aase, Reichborn-Kjennerud)
\textsuperscript{b}Department of Psychology, University of Oslo (Gustavson, Ystrom)
\textsuperscript{c}Department of Global Public Health and Primary care, University of Bergen (Stoltenberg)
\textsuperscript{d}Mailman School of Public Health, Columbia University (Susser)
\textsuperscript{e}New York State Psychiatric Institute (Susser)
\textsuperscript{f}The MRC Integrative Epidemiology Unit, University of Bristol, UK (Davey Smith)
\textsuperscript{g}School of Psychology, Cardiff University, UK (Langley)
\textsuperscript{h}MRC centre for neuropsychiatric genetics and genomics, Cardiff University, UK (Langley)
\textsuperscript{i}Institute of Psychiatry, Psychology & Neuroscience, King’s College London, UK (Rutter)
\textsuperscript{j}Institute of Clinical Medicine, University of Oslo (Reichborn-Kjennerud)

**Address correspondence to:** Kristin Gustavson, PhD, Norwegian Institute of Public Health, Department of Genetics, Environment, and Mental Health, P.O. Box 4404 Nydalen, 0403 Oslo, Norway.
[kristinbrun.gustavson@fhi.no](mailto:kristinbrun.gustavson@fhi.no); Telephone: +47 45032616

**Short title:** Smoking in Pregnancy and Child ADHD

**Funding source:** The Norwegian Mother and Child Cohort Study is supported by the Norwegian Ministry of Health and the Ministry of Education and Research, NIH/NIEHS (contract no N01-ES-75558), NIH/NINDS (grant no.1 U01 NS 047537-01 and grant no.2 U01 NS 047537-06A1). We are grateful to all the participating families in Norway who take part in this on-going cohort study.

**Financial disclosure:** The authors have no financial relationships relevant to this article to disclose.

**Conflicts of Interest:** The authors have no conflicts of interest relevant to this article to disclose.

**Abbreviations:** ADHD - attention-deficit/hyperactivity disorder
CI - confidence interval
DSM – Diagnostic and Statistical Manual of Mental Disorders
HKD – Hyperkinetic disorder
HR - hazard ratio
ICD-10 - International Classification of Diseases, 10th Revision
MoBa - Norwegian Mother and Child Cohort
What’s Known on This Subject: There is a well-documented association between maternal smoking in pregnancy and offspring attention-deficit/hyperactivity disorder (ADHD). Whether this reflects a causal relationship or is due to unmeasured confounding is not clear.

What This Study Adds: Three different negative controls as well as a sibling control all suggest that the association is due to unmeasured genetic or environmental confounding.
Contributors’ statement:

Dr. Gustavson conceptualized and designed the study, performed the analyses, interpreted results, drafted the initial manuscript, and approved the final manuscript as submitted.

Drs. Reichborn-Kjennerud, Ystrom, Stoltenberg, Susser, Surén, Magnus, Knudsen, Aase, Davey Smith, Langley, and Rutter conceptualized/designed the study, interpreted the results, critically reviewed the manuscript, and approved the final manuscript as submitted.
Abstract

**Background:** There is a well-documented association between maternal smoking during pregnancy and offspring attention-deficit/hyperactivity disorder (ADHD). The degree to which this reflects causal intra-uterine effects or is due to unmeasured confounding, is not clear.

**Objective:** To compare the association between maternal smoking during pregnancy and offspring ADHD to the associations with paternal smoking, grandmother’s smoking when pregnant with mother, and maternal smoking in previous pregnancies. Each of these exposures is expected to be influenced by much of the same confounding factors as maternal smoking during pregnancy, but cannot have direct intra-uterine effects. A sibling control design was also used.

**Methods:** The current study used data from the Norwegian Mother and Child Cohort Study (N > 100,000 children). Mothers and fathers reported on smoking during pregnancy, and mothers reported on smoking in previous pregnancies and their mothers’ smoking when pregnant with them. Mothers reported on child ADHD symptoms at 5 years of age. Information about child ADHD diagnosis was obtained from the Norwegian Patient Registry.

**Results:** Maternal smoking during pregnancy was not more strongly associated with offspring ADHD diagnosis than was paternal smoking, grandmother’s smoking when pregnant with mother, or maternal smoking in previous pregnancies. Sibling control analyses showed no association between maternal smoking in pregnancy and child ADHD symptoms among siblings discordant for maternal smoking.

**Conclusion:** These results suggest that the association between maternal smoking during pregnancy and offspring ADHD is not due to causal intra-uterine effects, but reflects unmeasured confounding.
Introduction

There is a well-documented association between maternal smoking during pregnancy and offspring attention-deficit/hyperactivity disorder (ADHD)\textsuperscript{1-3}. However, there is debate regarding the degree to which this reflects a causal intra-uterine effect of maternal smoking on the fetus or is due to unmeasured confounding\textsuperscript{4-6}.

Several approaches can be used to control for unmeasured confounding, and convergence of findings from different methods and cohorts provides the strongest support for causal claims\textsuperscript{7,8}. In sibling control designs, siblings discordant for maternal smoking during pregnancy are compared with respect to ADHD. Some studies using this approach have suggested that the association between maternal smoking during pregnancy and offspring ADHD is due to unmeasured confounding\textsuperscript{9-12} while a recent study suggested that the association may be causal\textsuperscript{5}.

The negative control approach compares the association of interest with another association that is affected by much of the same confounding factors, but that is not suspected to be causal\textsuperscript{13,14}. For example, if there is a causal intra-uterine effect of maternal smoking on offspring ADHD, this association should be stronger than the association with paternal smoking during pregnancy. Findings from studies using paternal smoking as a negative control have been mixed. One study\textsuperscript{15} suggested that the association between maternal smoking during pregnancy and offspring ADHD is due to unmeasured confounding, while another found results consistent with direct causality\textsuperscript{16}. The current study adds to existing knowledge by applying several methods within the same sample. We apply a sibling control design as well as three different negative control approaches: i) paternal smoking during pregnancy, ii) grandmother’s smoking when she was pregnant with mother, and iii) maternal smoking in previous pregnancies. If there is a causal intra-uterine effect of maternal smoking on offspring ADHD, we expect the association with maternal smoking to be stronger than the association with all the other conditions.
Methods

Study population
The current study use data from The Norwegian Mother and Child Cohort Study (MoBa), conducted by the Norwegian Institute of Public Health. Pregnant women from all over Norway were recruited between 1999 and 2008 when attending 17 weeks routine ultrasound examination, and 40.6% of the invited women consented to participate. The current study is based on version 9 of the quality-assured data files released for research in November 2015.

The cohort includes more than 110,000 children, 95,000 mothers, and 75,000 fathers. In line with previous similar studies, children with congenital malformations (n = 5,739) and children from multiple births (n = 3,662) were excluded from analyses.

MoBa has obtained a license from the Norwegian Data Inspectorate. The current study was approved by The Regional Committee for Medical Research Ethics.

Outcome
Information about children’s ADHD diagnosis was obtained from the Norwegian Patient Registry (NPR) (https://helsedirektoratet.no/English). From 2008, all government-financed hospitals and out-patient clinics report individual level-diagnoses according to the 10th revision of the International Classification of Disease (ICD-10) to NPR, based on civil registration number. Children diagnosed with an ICD-10-diagnosis of Hyperkinetic disorder (HKD) (F90) between 2008 and 2014 were defined as having ADHD. First time diagnoses as well as later contacts are registered.

This categorical ADHD variable did not give us sufficient statistical power to perform sibling comparisons. A dimensional measure of ADHD symptoms was therefore used. Mothers
responded to 6 questions about offspring ADHD in the 5-year questionnaire. These were taken from the Child Behaviour Checklist (CBCL)\(^{19}\) and have been rated by experts as very consistent with DSM criteria for ADHD\(^{20}\). The items were “Can’t concentrate, can’t pay attention for long”, “Can’t sit still, restless or overactive”, “Can’t stand waiting, wants everything now”, “Demands must be met immediately”, “Gets into everything”, and “Quickly shifts from one activity to another”. Items were rated from 1 (Not true) to 3 (Very true or often true). Mean scores of the six items were used in analyses. Cronbachs’ alpha was 0.73, mean score 1.42, and standard deviation 0.36.

**Exposures**

Mothers reported on smoking during the current and previous pregnancies. Both mothers and fathers reported on fathers’ smoking. Mothers also reported on whether her mother smoked during the pregnancy with her.

MoBa contains more detailed smoking information for mothers and fathers, e.g. number of cigarettes. This information is not available regarding grandmother’s smoking, smoking in previous pregnancies, or mother reported paternal smoking (used when fathers had not answered). Because the main aim of the current study was to compare maternal smoking with the other three smoking variables, only dichotomous smoking variables were used.

Information on maternal smoking was available for 93,285 pregnancies (89.0% of the sample). Data were available for 94,988 pregnancies (90.6%) regarding father’s smoking and for 83,658 pregnancies (79.8% of the sample) regarding grandmother’s smoking. Information on maternal smoking during previous pregnancies was available for 61,560 mothers (58.7% of the sample – only applicable to those who had been pregnant before).

Detailed information about covariates is given in eMethods in Supplement.
Statistical analyses

Analyses were performed using SPSS version 22 and Stata version 14. Multiple imputation (20 repetitions) was performed in SPSS on self-reported covariates and the dimensional ADHD measure at 5 years.

Associations between smoking and offspring ADHD diagnoses were examined in Cox proportional hazard models. The proportional hazard assumption was met for all the four smoking variables.

Based on previous literature, analyses were controlled for the following covariates: Maternal and paternal age, education, and ADHD symptoms, maternal (pre-pregnancy) and paternal BMI, maternal alcohol consumption during pregnancy, maternal parity, year of child’s birth, and geographical residential region. Birth weight appears later in time than smoking during pregnancy and is a more likely mediator than confounder. As expected, there was no association between child gender and maternal smoking (tetrachoric rho = 0.00), and gender was not included as a covariate. Initial analyses showed that the association between maternal smoking and offspring ADHD was very similar for boys and girls. Hence, analyses were not stratified on gender.

Sibling control analyses were performed by estimating within- and between-effects, as recommended by Begg and Parides. Within-effects are associations between maternal smoking and offspring ADHD among siblings of mothers who showed discordant smoking habits across pregnancies. Hence, these effects show associations between smoking and child ADHD controlled for time-invariant confounders associated with the mother. Between-effects are effects of having the same mother. These analyses were performed twice – with and without imputations.
on the 5 year ADHD measure, and were controlled for maternal parity and age, as well as child’s birth year.

There were 14,554 mothers who had participated in MoBa more than once – 13,671 twice, 860 three times, and 23 four times. A total of 38,427 respondents from the original sample also responded to the 5-year questionnaire. The number of discordant sibling pairs available for analyses was 530 when using imputed data on ADHD symptoms at 5 years, and 72 when not using imputed ADHD-data.

To test our design, we compared the association between maternal smoking and offspring birth weight to the association with the three negative controls. This has been done in similar studies before as smoking during pregnancy has well-documented causal effects on birth weight 16. We also analyzed the association between maternal smoking and offspring birth weight in a sibling control model.

**Results**

The total sample included 104,846 children, of which 2,035 (2.0%) were registered with an ADHD diagnosis. The prevalence was less than 1% among those who were 7 years and younger and 4.3% among those who were 14 years old in 2014. Hence, the relatively low proportion of ADHD in the current sample is likely due to the children being young. The sample consisted of 51% boys, and 43.7% of the women were expecting their first child.

The smoking prevalences were: 8.5% for mothers, 24.6% for fathers, 27.5% for grandmothers when pregnant with mother, and 15.6% for mothers in previous pregnancies. Descriptive statistics for covariates by smoking status and child diagnosis are presented in Table
1. Overlap between maternal smoking during pregnancy and the other smoking variables is shown in eTable 1 in Supplement.

Table 2 shows that all of the smoking variables (maternal and paternal smoking during pregnancy, grandmother’s smoking when pregnant with mother, and maternal smoking in previous pregnancies) were associated with offspring ADHD, and that they were similar in magnitude both before and after adjustment for covariates.

Table 3 shows results from chi-square tests of the null-hypotheses that maternal smoking during pregnancy was equally strongly associated with offspring ADHD as were the other smoking variables, when they were entered in the same analysis. The p-values for these tests were all >= 0.09.

Results from sibling analyses are presented in Table 4. Maternal smoking during pregnancy was associated with mother-reported ADHD symptoms when the child was 5 years in the total sample. There was, however, no such association when siblings discordant for maternal smoking were compared. The standard error of the sibling control results was less than half of the association in the total sample. Hence, there was sufficient statistical power to detect an association in the sibling comparison that was the same as the association in the total sample. This was true both with and without imputed data on the ADHD measure.

The between-effects showed that unmeasured maternal characteristics were associated with child ADHD symptoms.

In families where none of the parents smoked, 3,334 mothers reported being exposed to passive smoking from another household member or at work. Maternal exposure to passive smoking was not associated with child ADHD (OR = 0.94, SE = 0.12, p = 0.63).

Maternal smoking during pregnancy was more strongly related to offspring birth weight than the negative controls. See eTables 2 and 3 in Supplement. An association between maternal
smoking and offspring birth weight was found among siblings discordant for maternal smoking. See eResults in Supplement for details.

Discussion

In this large prospective birth cohort we found that the association between maternal smoking during pregnancy and offspring ADHD diagnosis was very similar in magnitude to the associations with three negative controls (paternal smoking in the same period, grandmother’s smoking when pregnant with the mother, and maternal smoking in previous pregnancies). The sibling control analyses showed an association between maternal smoking during pregnancy and maternally reported ADHD symptoms at 5 years in the whole sample, but not among siblings discordant for maternal smoking in pregnancy. The results suggest that the association between maternal smoking and offspring ADHD is due to unmeasured confounding factors. Maternal smoking during pregnancy was more strongly associated with offspring birth weight than the three negative control situations, and this association was also evident among siblings discordant for maternal smoking, indicating a causal relationship and giving credibility to our models.

These findings are in accordance with previous studies from the Avon Longitudinal Study of Parents and Children (ALSPAC), where maternal and paternal smoking were similarly associated with ADHD in the offspring \(^{15}\). Our results are, however, slightly different from those reported by Zhu and colleagues from a similar study in the Danish birth cohort \(^{16}\). They found that the association between maternal smoking during pregnancy and ADHD was stronger than the association with paternal smoking, providing indications of a causal effect.

The current study used an ADHD symptoms measure consisting mainly of items covering hyperactivity/impulsivity. Our findings are, however, not in accordance with results from a recent
sibling control study, concluding that there may be a casual effect of maternal smoking during pregnancy on maternally reported ADHD symptoms, particularly regarding hyperactivity/impulsivity. Our findings are more in line with other previous studies using sibling control designs concluding that the association between maternal smoking during pregnancy and offspring ADHD seems to be primarily confounded by genetic and/or environmental factors, and also consistent with several other studies reporting that the associations between maternal smoking during pregnancy and different child outcomes (e.g. intelligence, conduct problems) are due to unmeasured confounding.

Thapar and colleagues were able to separate confounding due to genetic versus environmental factors using a novel design. They compared offspring conceived through in vitro fertilization using eggs from the mother or from genetically unrelated women. The results indicated that the magnitude of the association between maternal smoking during pregnancy and offspring ADHD was stronger in the genetically related mother-offspring pairs than in the unrelated, suggesting that the association between maternal smoking during pregnancy and offspring ADHD reflects genetic confounding.

The current findings are in accordance with the fact that ADHD rates in the population have been stable across several decades even though smoking rates have decreased, both in general and during pregnancy. Nevertheless, conclusions from the current study must be made with caution as we have used observational data. For example, Yerushalmy observed that the association between maternal smoking during pregnancy and child birth weight was similar to the association with paternal smoking in a Californian birth cohort (results from his 1962 paper are reprinted in Keyes et al. (2014)). He thus concluded that maternal smoking during pregnancy was unlikely to be causally linked to birth weight. He also observed that women had increased risk of having small children even if they started smoking after pregnancy, which
supported his conclusion. In light of later evidence, his conclusion seems to be wrong even though it was based on legitimate reasoning. This example illustrates the importance of basing conclusions on results from different samples as well as different designs.

**Strengths and limitations**

The current study has several strengths, such as a large sample size, prospective assessment of exposure, and diagnoses obtained from linkage to a national registry. However, the following limitations need to be taken into consideration. First, ADHD may not have been identified in some children. This may be particularly relevant for the youngest children, as ADHD diagnoses are seldom given to pre-school children. Prevalence of ADHD diagnoses in the NPR increases considerably each year from age 5 to age 11. Cox proportional hazard regression was used to ensure that participants who were censored at the end of the study period without an ADHD diagnosis were compared to children with ADHD diagnosis at the same age. Hence, the effect of age on the likelihood of having been registered with an ADHD diagnosis was controlled for. Some may have been diagnosed before 2008 without having contact with in- or outpatient clinics thereafter. However, the young age of the participants suggests that this is unlikely to have caused high numbers of false negatives. There may potentially also be some false positives (i.e. incorrect ADHD diagnoses). Sensitivity analyses excluding children with only one registration of ADHD in the NPR were performed. This did not change the conclusions. The prevalence of ADHD in MoBa was 2.8% among boys and 1.1% among girls. This boy/girl ratio (~2.5) is similar to what is found for children and adolescents in the whole NPR. All ADHD medication use in Norway is registered in the Norwegian Prescription Database. More than 80% of children registered with ADHD in NPR, also use medication for ADHD, according to the Norwegian Prescription Database. This also applies to MoBa participants with ADHD diagnoses. These findings further strengthen the notion of valid ADHD data in the current study. Second, as there
may be stigma related to smoking, and particularly to smoking during pregnancy, participants may have under-reported smoking in the current study. However, this problem is likely to be small as the participants provided information about smoking in questionnaires rather than to health care professionals. Among women who had participated in MoBa more than once, 95% of classifications of concurrent smoking (yes/no) given in one pregnancy, was consistent with classification of smoking in previous pregnancies (yes/no) given in a later pregnancy, thus supporting the notion of only minimal problems with self-reported smoking. Also, in families where both mother and father provided information on paternal smoking, 98.5% of fathers reported smoking if the mother had reported that he did (Kappa = 0.78), indicating high quality of the self-reported smoking data. However, some differential misclassification of smoking status is likely and may have biased the estimates. For example, if a mother who smoked in two pregnancies, erroneously reported to be a non-smoker in one of them, sibling comparisons may be biased toward the null. The sibling design may also be biased by potential epigenetic changes induced outside the pregnancy period. Further studies are needed to examine such epigenetic effects. Third, there was a higher proportion of women smoking in previous pregnancies than in the current pregnancy. This difference may be due to declining smoking trends. The current analyses were adjusted for child’s birth year to prevent results from being affected by this. Fourth, the results could be biased due to effects of passive smoking. However, our results indicated that passive smoking was not associated with increased risk of child ADHD. This is also in line with findings from Langley and colleagues. Fifth, individuals with low educational level, young age, and smokers are under-represented in MoBa, which may reduce the generalizability of the findings. However, the previously well-documented association between maternal smoking during pregnancy and offspring ADHD was replicated in the current study despite some under-representation of smokers. Also, the additional analyses on the association
between maternal smoking and offspring birth weight suggested that there were enough smokers in the sample to show the expected effects of smoking on fetal development.

**Conclusion**

The current study applied several different approaches, and they all concur in indicating that the association between maternal smoking during pregnancy and offspring ADHD is not directly causal, but confounded by unmeasured factors. Maternal smoking during pregnancy was not more strongly associated with offspring ADHD diagnosis than paternal smoking during pregnancy, grandmother’s smoking when pregnant with mother, or maternal smoking in previous pregnancies. There was no association between maternal smoking during pregnancy and offspring ADHD symptoms in siblings discordant for maternal smoking. The current results underscore the usefulness of applying multiple methods including natural experimental designs to explore the causal relationships that may underlie the associations evident in observational studies.
References


Table legends

Table 1. Characteristics of family members by maternal smoking status and child ADHD diagnosis.

*Notes: a) Maternal BMI when she became pregnant*

Table 2. Associations between smoking during pregnancy and offspring ADHD diagnoses examined with four separate Cox proportional hazard analyses.

*Notes: Separate analyses were performed for each of the four smoking variables so that the associations between each of them and offspring ADHD are not controlled for each other. Ref: reference group to which smokers are compared. a) Observation period between January 2008 and December 2014 for participants born in or before January 2008. b) Per 100,000 person-months under observed risk. c) Adjusted for the following covariates: Maternal and paternal age, maternal and paternal education, maternal and paternal ADHD symptoms, maternal (pre-pregnancy) and paternal BMI, maternal alcohol consumption during pregnancy, parity, child’s birth year, and geographical region. d) Only applicable to women who had been pregnant before.*

Table 3. The association between maternal smoking and offspring ADHD diagnoses compared to the associations with three negative controls, mutually adjusted for each other.

*Notes: a) Maternal smoking and the negative controls mutually adjusted for each other, but not adjusted for covariates b) Maternal smoking and the negative controls mutually adjusted for each other and for the following covariates: Maternal and paternal age, maternal and paternal education, maternal and paternal ADHD symptoms, maternal (pre-pregnancy) and paternal BMI, maternal alcohol consumption during pregnancy, parity, child’s birth year, and geographical region. Chi-square values were obtained from testing three null-hypotheses that the association between maternal smoking and offspring ADHD diagnoses was equal to each of the three other associations (Wald tests). Degrees of freedom = 1 in all tests.*

Table 4. Results from sibling comparison analyses of the association between maternal smoking during pregnancy and child ADHD symptoms, with and without imputed missing values on the ADHD measure.

*Notes: a) Missing values were imputed on the ADHD-measure, and 530 sibling pairs discordant for maternal smoking were available for analysis; b) Missing values were not imputed on the ADHD-measure, yielding 72 sibling pairs discordant for maternal smoking available for analysis. All analyses were controlled for parity, maternal age, and child’s birth year.*